



CHRIS CHRISTIE
Governor

KIM GUADAGNO
Lt. Governor

New Jersey Office of the Attorney General

Division of Consumer Affairs
State Real Estate Appraisers Board
124 Halsey Street, 3rd Floor, Newark, NJ 07102



JOHN J. HOFFMAN
Acting Attorney General

STEVE C. LEE
Acting Director

Mailing Address:
P.O. Box 45032
Newark, NJ 07101
(973) 504-6480

STATE REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD

PUBLIC SESSION MINUTES

APRIL 28, 2015

The regular meeting of the Board of Real Estate Appraisers was held at 124 Halsey Street on the 3RD Floor on Tuesday, **APRIL 28, 2015**. The meeting was convened in accordance with the provisions of the Open Public Meeting Act. Board Secretary, Mr. Krauser called the meeting to order at 9:30 A.M. A roll call was taken and the following attendance was recorded for these minutes:

John A. McCann	Present
Barry J. Krauser	Present
Cheryl A. Randolph-Sharpe	Present
Joseph Palumbo	Excused

Also, present were: Steven Flanzman, Senior Deputy Attorney General; Barbara Lopez, Deputy Attorney General; Charles Kirk, Acting Executive Director; Emilio Aviles, staff.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MARCH 31, 2015

Following review and discussion by the Board and upon motion of Mr. McCann, seconded by Mrs. Sharpe it was determined that the minutes of March 31, 2015 be approved. A vote was taken and the motion was carried, unanimously.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Acting Executive Director, Mr. Charles Kirk made the following announcements:

- *** Board Member Mr. Palumbo was excused for this meeting.
- *** There were two Investigative Inquiries scheduled for this meeting.

Public Session Minutes of April 28, 2015

CONTINUING EDUCATION

PROVIDER		COURSE TITLE	HOURS
Dynasty School	(1)	Supervisor - Trainee Course	4 Hrs. Of C.E.
State Agriculture Development Committee	(1)	Annual Conference	3.5 Hrs. Of C.E.
Appraisal Institute	(1)	AI Connect 2015 Day 1	2 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(2)	AI Connect 2015 Day 2	4 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(3)	AI Connect 2015 Day 3	4 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(4)	AI Connect 2015 Day 4	4 Hrs. Of C.E.
Metro NJ Appraisal Institute	(1)	Appraising Condos, Co-Ops & PUDs	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(2)	Real Estate Finance, Value & Investment Performance	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
McKissock	(1)	Adjustments: Supported or Not Supported?	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
Allterra Group, LLC	(1)	2015 Keynote / The Vision for Valuation	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(2)	2015 Regulatory Update / Best Practices	7 Hrs. Of C.E.

RENEWALS

ASFMRA	(1)	General Market Analysis & Highest & Best Use	28 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.
	(2)	Cost Approach for General Appraisers Online	27 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.

Public Session Minutes of April 28, 2015

	(3)	Sales Comparison Approach for General Appraisers	27 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.
	(4)	Income Approach for General Appraisers	27 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.
	(5)	Advanced Rural Case Studies	36 Hrs. Of C.E.
McKissock, LP	(1)	General Appraiser Income Approach	55 Hrs. Of C.E. & 60 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.

INDIVIDUAL REQUEST

Nicole Carr	(1)	Online General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	28 Hrs. Of C.E.
-------------	-----	---	------------------------

Following review and discussion by the Education Committee of the Board and upon motion of Mr. McCann, seconded by Mrs. Sharpe it was determined that the C.E. Courses and Renewals and Individual Requests listed above did meet the established criteria for the designated approved hours and that they be approved as noted above. A vote was taken and the motion was carried, unanimously

APPRAISAL SUBCOMMITTEE

***** Appraisal Standards Board - USPAP Q & A - January 14, 2014**

***** Appraiser Qualifications Board - January 27, 2015 re:** "Fifth Exposure Draft of a Proposed Revision to the 2015 Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria and Guide Note 9 (GN-9).

***** Appraiser Qualifications Board - February 19, 2015 re:** Second Exposure Draft of Proposed Personal Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria.

***** Letter from James R. Park, Executive Director of the Appraisal Subcommittee dated April 22, 2015 re:** the approval and release to the public of the AMC Final Rule- *Minimum Requirements for Appraisal Management Companies* (Rule).

The Board reviewed, discussed and duly noted the above matters.

DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS TAKEN

- ** IMO – THOMAS J. SLIWOWSKI - Consent Order Filed April 2, 2015 imposing:**
- ** Formal Reprimand**
 - ** \$2,500.00 Civil Penalty**
 - ** \$315.25 in Costs**
 - ** Successful completion of a 15 Hour Residential Report Writing and Case Studies Course**
 - ** Successful completion of a 15 Hour USPAP Course**
- ** IMO – SUSAN ATOR - Order of Summary Suspension Filed April 2, 2015 noting that Ms. Ator’s license to practice real estate appraising in the State of New Jersey was suspended on January 30, 2014 for her failure to renew. The Order of Summary Suspension imposes that prior to Board’s consideration of any application for reinstatement, Ms. Ator shall appear before the Board to discuss her 2012-2013 submissions to the Board and demonstrate her readiness to re-enter the practice of real estate appraising. - - - see copy attached.**
- ** IMO – EDWARD G. IRELAND, III - Final Order Withdrawing Provisional Order of Discipline Filed April 2, 2015.**
- ** The Provisional Order of Discipline filed on February 20, 2015 is withdrawn in its entirety.**
- ** IMO – JAY S. ROSENTHAL – Consent Order Filed April 6, 2015 imposing:**
- ** Reprimand**
 - ** \$1,500.00 Civil Penalty**
 - ** Successful completion of an Advanced Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use Course**
 - ** Successful completion of a 15 Hour USPAP Course**
 - ** Successful completion of a Basic Appraisal Procedures Course**

The Board reviewed, discussed and duly noted the above Orders.

Public Session Minutes of April 28, 2015

OTHER

**** Supreme Court of the United State decision decided on February 25, 2015 re: North Carolina State Board of Dental Examiners vs. Federal Trade Commission.**

The Board reviewed, discussed and duly noted the above matter.

PENDING APPLICATIONS

Certified Residential

Joseph Medici

Andrew Duda

Certified General

Alison K. Hennessy

Following review and discussion by the Board of the above noted applicants and upon motion of Mr. McCann, seconded by Mrs. Sharpe it was determined that the above noted candidates did meet the established criteria for Licensure and that their applications be approved. A vote was taken and the motion carried, unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Bruce Shapiro of the Appraisal Community addressed the Board with issues of mutual concern.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon motion of Mr. McCann, seconded by Mrs. Sharpe it was determined that the Public Meeting be adjourned at 11 A.M. and the Board proceed to the Executive Session. A vote was taken and the motion carried, unanimously

Respectfully submitted,

CHARLES F. KIRK
For the Board